

**San Francisco Bay Joint Venture
Conservation Delivery Committee Meeting
Tuesday, March 29, 2011
The War Room, Hamilton Field, Novato
500 Palm Drive, Novato, California 94949**

Meeting Notes

In attendance: Marc Holmes, Chair (The Bay Institute), Kathi Borgmann (Audubon California), Arriana Brand (US Geological Survey), Chris Choo (Marin Co Dept of Public Works), Paul Curfman (ESA Associates), Tom Gandesbery (State Coastal Conservancy), Matt Gerhart (State Coastal Conservancy), Joel Gerwein (State Coastal Conservancy), Brenda Goeden (Bay Conservation and Development Commission), John Krause (Department of Fish and Game), Rebecca Lawton (Sonoma Ecology Center), Jeremy Lowe (ESA PWA), Meg Marriott (US Fish and Wildlife Service), Julian Meisler (Sonoma Land Trust), Melissa Pitkin (PRBO Conservation Science), Raynelle Rino (Literacy for Environmental Justice), Niall Roberts (Congresswoman Lynn Woolsey), Brian Ross (US EPA), Barbara Salzman (Bay Area Audubon Council), Renee Spent (Ducks Unlimited), Elisa Stancil (Jack London Lake Alliance), David Thomson (US Fish and Wildlife Service), Laura Valoppi (USGS), Bruce Wolfe (SF Bay Regional Water Quality Control Board), Julian Wood (PRBO Conservation Science), David Yearsley (Friends of the Petaluma River), Betty Young (Golden Gate National Parks Conservancy)
SFBJV Staff: Beth Huning (Coordinator), Christina Sloop (Science Coordinator), Caroline Warner (Outreach Coordinator), Sandra Scoggin (Assistant Coordinator)

The meeting was preceded by a site visit to the Hamilton Wetland Restoration Project. Visit the SFBJV Habitat Project Tracking System for a full update on the project. Contact Sandra Scoggin (sscoggin@sfbayjv.org) for a username and password.

1. Welcome and Introductions

2. The LTMS Program: New challenges in the face of sea level rise and sediment deficits and Update on the US Army Corps Dredged Material Management Plan (DMMP)

Brenda Goeden of BCDC and Brian Ross of EPA presented an overview of the Long Term Management Strategy (LTMS) program and current challenges to the estuary. Scott Bodensteiner of Weston Solutions also provided information on the LTMS and on the USACE's DMMP.

The San Francisco Bay LTMS is the implementing arm of the Comprehensive Coordinated Management Plan (CCMP) for dredging and waterway modification. The goals of the LTMS program are to maintain those channels necessary for navigation and eliminate unnecessary dredging, conduct dredged material disposal in the most environmentally sound manner, maximize use of dredged material as a resource, and establish a cooperative permitting framework.

The LTMS "40-40-20 Plan" called for a fundamental shift away from looking at the Bay as a convenient, cheap waste dump for most dredged material and toward realizing as much beneficial reuse of dredged material as possible, with a minimum of in-Bay disposal.

The LTMS has been on track to date but because of unforeseeable short and long term challenges, the future is uncertain and will require an ongoing spirit of partnership and cooperation, and local support for funding to help make re-use practicable for as many dredgers as possible. Some of the unforeseen challenges are financial, including increasing costs for ocean disposal, hydraulic offloading at reuse sites, and flat or decreasing dredging budgets and sediment deficit. In addition, the effects of climate change,

especially sea level rise, will accelerate habitat loss and other changes. Five key challenges facing the entire estuary are the decline of biological resources (especially wetlands and related habitats), increased pollution, freshwater diversions and altered flow regime, intensified land use and population, and dredging and waterway modification.

Brenda and Brian presented some ideas on ways for the LTMS to move forward in the face of these new challenges and are interested in soliciting input from the environmental community. The full presentation is available on the SFBJV website at http://www.sfbayjv.org/resources.php#SF_LTMS

The Corps is in the process of finalizing their Environmental Benefit Ranking for the San Francisco Bay DMMP, Capacity and Cost Evaluation, and Trade-off Analysis, with alternatives analysis and selection expected by the end of 2011. The South Bay DMM Implementation Plan is working on their Preliminary Feasibility study, as well as their Cooperative Agreements with project sponsors, and developing Project Management Plans.

Since there was not enough time remaining to adequately discuss the sediment management presentations, another meeting will be scheduled to focus solely on the issue in order to develop a process for engagement with the LTMS or recommendations on how the JV and our partners can help resolve issues. [NOTE: That meeting has been set for September 1 from 10 am to 4 pm.]

3. Jack London Lake project update

Becca Lawton of the Sonoma Ecology Center and Elisa Stancil of the Jack London Lake Alliance distributed a detailed packet of project information and maps and provided a brief verbal update on the status of the Jack London Lake project. The project was presented to the Committee in December 2010 for potential adoption by the JV. At the December meeting, committee members indicated that more information on the biological implications of the project is needed before an adoption vote could be taken.

As there are red-legged frog and other surveys currently underway, the project managers decided to wait for those survey results before bringing a follow up presentation back to the Committee.

4. Oakland Airport Safety Zone Mitigation

Beth Huning summarized a recent communication from URS, who have approached the JV and several individual partners on behalf of the Oakland Airport, seeking projects to mitigate their federally-mandated airport safety zone. It appears that some of the regulatory agencies have been contacted and others haven't.

The committee decided that we would follow the SFBJV mitigation policy of ensuring that we not make recommendations on projects until such time as the project has been defined and coordinated with the regulatory agencies.

5. SFBJV Monitoring and Evaluation Plan

Christina Sloop, SFBJV Science Coordinator, presented a detailed overview of the background, progress and status of the SFBJV M&E Plan. She presented her complete vision for the M&E framework and timeline and outlined several M&E plan phases, with current activities representing Phase I, due to be completed by June 30, 2011.

Some key elements included goals and objectives and fundamental questions to be answered:

The M&E plan will build a framework to:

- Evaluate conservation investment over time
- Provide accountability for JV conservation delivery program progress & effectiveness

- Assess regional environmental change
 - How will it affect JV Conservation Delivery?
- Inform future planning and decision-making
- Identify primary and priority research needs
- Provide basis to justify monitoring funding

The M&E plan will provide answers to the following fundamental questions:

- Where are the wetlands?
 - size, distribution
- What is their condition?
 - Function, threats, stage of ‘evolution’
- Where and how are our target organisms?
 - abundance & distribution status, habitat needs, threat thresholds
- What is ‘our’ (JV partnership projects) contribution?

For much more information on this effort, see the full presentation at <http://goo.gl/NvXNJ> or http://www.sfbjv.pyxisweb.net/index.php?option=com_jdownloads&Itemid=60&view=view.download&catid=53&cid=150

Since the meeting, a Monitoring and Evaluation Plan Workshop has been scheduled for May 26. This will be a daylong professionally-facilitated workshop aimed at finalizing and vetting the first phase of the San Francisco Bay Joint Venture Monitoring and Evaluation Plan. If you have not received the meeting announcement and would like more information, contact Christina at csloop@sfbayjv.org.

6. San Francisco Bay Area State of the Birds Report

Melissa Pitkin, of PRBO Conservation Science gave an overview and status of the San Francisco Bay Area State of the Birds Report. The report will focus on the nine county bay area and will be targeted at decision makers, restoration practitioners, managers and planners. The purpose is to improve bird and habitat conservation in the SF Bay.

The Report is divided into sections by habitat type, with each section containing figures and summary, threats, and actions. Success stories referenced when available. Habitat types are:

- Subtidal
- Tidal flats
- Salt ponds
- Tidal Marsh
- Upland
- Man-made
- Endangered Species

PRBO Conservation Science is the lead on the report, with many other entities contributing significantly including Audubon Canyon Ranch, San Francisco Bay Bird Observatory, U.S. Geological Survey, Audubon California, Laney College and the SF Bay Joint Venture.

Findings are that most bird populations are stable, with a few increasing. Certain species however show cause for concern. The report also outlines key threats to our SF Bay birds, shows which species are showing increases, which are remaining stable and which are showing declines, and which are showing mixed or uncertain trends.

The next steps are:

- Review by peers, revise
- Finalize content and layout
- Create Website
- Conduct outreach

Action: Any committee members interested in reviewing or desire more detail on the reports should contact Melissa at mpitkin@prbo.org

7. Seasonal Wetland Goals Update

Beth Huning, SFBJV Coordinator, described the process used to gather information on potential seasonal wetland protection and restoration sites through a series of mapping charrettes. Maps and reports have been finalized by Ducks Unlimited. The final report was distributed prior to the meeting. Options for next steps are to update our goals based on the existing final report, to find funding to use this report as the basis, but also incorporate additional existing data sets, or put a team together to put together a scope of work for additional phases to hone in on priority habitats and calculate specific goals.

Since not all committee members had reviewed the Seasonal Wetlands Goals report prior to the meeting, it was agreed that we would take another two weeks for review. Committee members were instructed to review and provide feedback as to whether they feel we should accept the goals as is or accept them on a temporary basis and take further steps to incorporate the additional data sets and assess biological values. Results of that review will be communicated to the Management Board when available.

8. Project Updates and Announcements

Laura Valoppi: A webinar with SF Bay researchers on NOAA's National Ocean Service (NOS) Physical Oceanographic Real Time System (PORTS) will be held on April 21 at 11 am. The system was installed in 1998 to monitor San Francisco Bay's water surface elevation, currents, temperature, salinity, and meteorological information at six-minute intervals at sites in the bay.

On Monday, June 13, 2011 from 1 to 3 pm in Menlo Park, there will be a seminar targeted toward researchers and scientists working in the south San Francisco Bay to better understand NOAA CO-OPS vertical data information. The purpose of the seminar is for researchers and scientists to have a clear understanding of the vertical data and water level data on the NOAA CO-OPS website, and to understand how to read, and how not to read, the CO-OPS materials available on their website. Please sign up for this seminar via the eventbrite link. There is no charge. <http://sbspdatumseminar.eventbrite.com/>

Sandra Scoggin: Updated SFBJV Project maps were distributed and are available on the website and in hard copy on request. Please review your project information and submit any corrections or additions to Sandra.

Matt Gerhart: The Bay Area Ecosystems Climate Change Consortium (BAECCC) has hired Andrew Gunther as their Coordinator. This position has been funded by the Moore Foundation for coordination of BAECCC and updating of the Bayland Ecosystems Goals Report. The next BAECCC meeting will be on April 11 from 10am-2pm.

Beth Huning: Skaggs Island is going to transfer from the Navy to the Fish and Wildlife Service the day after tomorrow. A celebration being scheduled.

Julian Meisler: They will soon have a new meeting space available at Sears Point. It holds about 30 people and will be available to partner groups.

Caroline Warner: The State of the Estuary will be on September 20th and 21st. There will be an open forum to gather ideas and session lead volunteers on April 8.

On May 6 the SFBJV will be hosting a tour with the Restoration Authority Advisory Committee.

The US Fish and Wildlife Service is launching a program to produce a new story every day. Caroline is gathering stories. These are short stories with a maximum of 500 words.

9. The Conservation Delivery Committee meeting of March 29, 201 was adjourned